Reflex sympathetic dystrophy of the hand: an excessive inflammatory response?

Wim J.G. Oyen a,*, Ivo E. Arntz b, Roland A.M.J. Claessens a, Jos W.M. Van der Meer c, Frans H.M. Corstens a and R. Jan A. Goris b

Departments of a Nuclear Medicine, b Surgery and c Internal Medicine, University Hospital Nijmegen, Nijmegen (Netherlands)

(Received 13 August 1992, revision received 18 March 1993, accepted 16 April 1993)

Summary In 23 patients with reflex sympathetic dystrophy (RSD) of the hand, scintigraphy with indium-111 labeled human non-specific polyclonal immunoglobulin G (In-111-IgG) was performed to investigate whether inflammatory characteristics are present in RSD. Both blood flow and accumulation over 48 h were assessed. Nineteen patients had increased flow to the affected hand, and 3 had decreased flow. One patient had bilateral RSD. Exercise provoked aggravation of complaints and signs in all patients. The affected/non-affected hand ratio (target-to-background, T/B) immediately before and after exercise did not change significantly. The T/B ratios 48 h after In-111-IgG injection were significantly higher in patients with RSD less than 5 months than in patients with RSD existing 5 months or longer. The T/B ratios 24 and 48 h after In-111-IgG injection were not correlated with the flow T/B ratios. In fact, 2 of the 3 patients with a decreased flow showed excess accumulation on the late images. Significantly more patients with early RSD, existing less than 5 months, had a positive In-111-IgG scintigraphy (14 of 17) than the patients with late RSD (1 of 6). Increased vascular permeability for macromolecules, an important characteristic of inflammation, appears to play a role in the development of RSD. This phenomenon is not flow-dependent.

Key words: Reflex sympathetic dystrophy; Indium-111 labeled immunoglobulin G; Radionuclide imaging; Scintigraphy

Introduction

Reflex sympathetic dystrophy (RSD) is a disabling complication that may occur after extremity injury and in the course of myocardial infarction, neurologic and rheumatologic diseases (Kozin et al. 1981; Greyson and Tepperman 1984; Procacci and Maresca 1987; Goris et al. 1990). RSD can be induced by fracture, surgery or even minimal trauma to an extremity, such as a sprain or a contusion. In some patients, no cause can be identified. Although RSD may resolve without special treatment, therapy-resistant pain and severely limited function of the affected extremity may ensue.

In the literature, there is no consensus on the pathophysiological mechanism of RSD. It has been postulated that RSD is a disorder of the sympathetic nervous system, a vascular tone abnormality or that it is of psychogenic origin (Kozin et al. 1976a; Poplawski et al. 1983). Recently, Hannington-Kiff (1991) hypothesized that failed natural opioid modulation in regional sympathetic ganglia may cause RSD. Sudeck's (1942, 1900) original theory that RSD is an excessive inflammatory reaction found little support. However, in the acute phase of RSD, all classical signs and symptoms of inflammation rubor, calor, dolor, tumor and functio laesa of the affected extremity are present (Goris et al. 1987, 1990). This hypothesis is further supported by the therapeutic effect of corticosteroids in some patients (Christensen et al. 1982).

In previous studies, it has been reported that indium-111 labeled human non-specific polyclonal im-
munoglobulin G (In-111-IgG) accumulates in infectious and inflammatory lesions (Fischman et al. 1988; Lamuraglia et al. 1989; Rubin et al. 1989; Oyen et al. 1990, 1991, 1992a,b). Accumulation of In-111-IgG has been shown to result from increased vascular permeability in these foci (Morrel et al. 1989; Oyen et al. 1992c). In RSD, it has been suggested that toxic oxygen radicals cause an inflammatory reaction (Goris et al. 1987). The aim of this study was to evaluate such a possible inflammatory component in RSD in patients with clinical evidence of early RSD of the upper limb using this new scintigraphic technique rather than to establish the diagnostic value of this method.

Patients and methods

Clinical assessment

Since there is no clear definition for the clinical assessment of RSD, patients were scored for signs and symptoms indicative for RSD. Of the following 6 symptoms, at least 5 should be present in an area larger than the primary injury: unexplained diffuse pain, abnormal skin temperature, abnormal skin color, diffuse edema, unexplained limitation of the range of motion, and increase of these signs and symptoms after exercise (Hanna and Peat 1989; Atkins et al. 1990; Goris et al. 1990).

The duration of RSD was classified according to the hemodynamic phases identified by Demangeat et al. (1988): stage I, 0–5 months after onset; stage II, 5–14 months after onset; stage III, patients (duration: >14 months) were not studied in this series.

Patients

Twenty-three patients were studied (7 male, 16 female; mean age: 46.9 years; range: 20–71 years). In 5 patients, RSD was the consequence of a Colles’ fracture, in 5 of a fracture of one or more of the metacarpals, in 6 of finger tendon or carpal tunnel surgery, and in 5 of distortion or contusion of the hand. In 2 patients, no cause for the development of RSD could be identified. One of them suffered from dystrofry of the affected hand, being more explicit in the area with increased uptake in the affected hand and over the corresponding area in the contralateral hand. This region was then projected on the static images obtained at earlier time points. T/B ratios were calculated for each time point. The image obtained 5 min postinjection was considered to be the ‘baseline’ for the T/B ratios. An In-111-IgG scintigraphy was interpreted as positive, if on the static images accumulation of activity in the affected hand increased with time, compared to the non-affected hand (Oyen et al. 1990).

When no increasing activity over time was noted on the static images, the In-111-IgG scintigraphy was considered to be negative. For the patient with bilateral RSD, of course, T/B ratios could not be calculated.

Four patterns, describing the evolution of T/B ratios over time in individual patients, could be distinguished: (pattern A): increased activity in the flow phase, a slightly elevated T/B ratio at the early static images, followed by a steady increase of the T/B ratio up to 48 h; (pattern B): increased activity in the flow phase, a slightly elevated T/B ratio at the early static images, not followed by an increase of the T/B ratio at the later images; (pattern C): decreased activity in the flow phase, followed by a steady increase to a maximum T/B ratio at 48 h; (pattern D): decreased activity in the flow phase, followed by symmetrical uptake on the static images.

Statistical analysis

All mean values are expressed ± S.D. The results of scintigraphy were analyzed using the χ² test, Spearman’s rank correlation test, Student’s t test and Wilcoxon’s signed rank test.

Results

Table I presents the clinical data of the patients. Although all patients meet the designated clinical criteria for RSD, a clinically significant difference between stages I and II is the degree of atrophy and dystrofry of the affected hand, being more explicit in stage II. In Table II, the T/B ratios of the individual patients are given.

Dynamic images

Nineteen patients showed an increased flow in the affected hand (mean T/B ratio: 1.64 ± 0.63). In 3 patients, the flow was decreased (mean T/B ratio: 0.70 ± 0.10). For the patients with a decreased arterial
flow, the T/B in the venous phase was 0.79 ± 0.14, for the other patients 1.23 ± 0.16.

Static images

Fig. 1 is a typical example of the static In-111-IgG images obtained in a patient with RSD.

Visually, 8 patients had a negative In-111-IgG scintigraphy. In these patients, T/B ratios after 48 h were 1.20 or less with no or only minimal relative increase over time. In 14 patients, a focal and with time increasing accumulation was noted in the affected hand (positive In-111-IgG scintigraphy). These 14 patients had a T/B ratio after 48 h ranging from 1.28 to 1.87. On the static images, no patient had an activity uptake that decreased with time. The patient with bilateral RSD showed an elevated, over time increasing activity in both hands on the scintigraphic images. Two of the 3 patients with diminished activity in the flow phases had a positive In-111-IgG scintigraphy (T/B ratios after 48 h 1.35 and 1.73, respectively), the other patient showed symmetrical activity uptake after 48 h.

Although exercise provoked aggravation of symptoms in all patients, the T/B ratios did not change from the 5 min image to the 20 min image (Wilcoxon's signed rank test, P > 0.10).

The T/B ratios after 24 and 48 h were not significantly correlated with the arterial and venous phase T/B ratios (Spearman's rank correlation test, P > 0.10).

T/B patterns

In 11 stage I patients and 1 stage II patient, pattern A was observed. Three stage I patients and 4 stage II patients showed pattern B. In only 3 patients, the flow to affected hand was relatively lower than the flow to normal hand. Of these 3 patients, 2 patients (both stage I) showed pattern C and 1 patient (stage II) showed pattern D.

---

**TABLE I**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0-20 sec</td>
<td>20-60 sec</td>
<td>5 min</td>
<td>20 min</td>
<td>4 h</td>
<td>24 h</td>
<td>48 h</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>inc.</td>
<td>inc.</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>1.32</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>n.d.</td>
<td>1.21</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>1.34</td>
<td>1.33</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>1.27</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>1.43</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>1.40</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Bilateral abnormalities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.31</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>1.26</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>1.53</td>
<td>1.24</td>
<td>1.29</td>
<td>1.43</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

1 Pain: +, severe; ±, moderate; –, none; Temp.: skin temperature (N, normal; ↓, decreased; ↑, increased); Edema: +, clearly present; ±, mild edema; –, absent; Color: skin color (N, normal; B, blue discoloration; R, red discoloration); RoM: range of motion (N, normal; ↓, limited); and Exerc.: effect of exercise (N, no effect; ↑, increase of signs and symptoms).

2 All patients also had moderate or severe hyperalgesia as well as allodynia in the affected area.
20 min. 4 h. 24 h. 48 h.

Fig. 1. In-111-IgG scintigraphy of a 34-year-old female patient (no. 11 in the table), who sustained fractures of metacarpals II–IV of the right hand 2 months prior to scintigraphy. She developed a painful, swollen right hand with loss of function. Maximal exercise of the right hand: 5 times inflation of the manometer to 150 mm Hg. From left to right: images and T/B ratios after 20 min, 4, 24, and 48 h. Note the relative increase of activity over time in the affected right hand.

Correlation with duration of RSD

The arterial and venous phase T/B ratios were not significantly different for stage I and II RSD. The arterial phase T/B ratios were 1.61 ± 0.75 (range: 0.59–3.26) and 1.20 ± 0.31 (range: 0.73–1.68), respectively (Student’s t test, P > 0.05). The venous phase T/B ratios were 1.22 ± 0.24 (range: 0.71–1.61) and 1.05 ± 0.19 (range: 0.71–1.25), respectively (Student’s t test, P > 0.05).

The T/B ratios after 48 h for stage I RSD were significantly higher compared to those of stage II RSD: 1.51 ± 0.26 and 1.09 ± 0.09 for stages I and stage II, respectively (Student’s t test, P < 0.05). Fig. 2 represents the T/B ratio after 48 h correlated with the duration of RSD.

Of the 17 patients with stage I RSD (including the patient with bilateral RSD), 14 showed an over time increasing activity uptake in the affected hand, while only 1 of 6 patients with stage II RSD had a positive In-111-IgG scintigraphy (χ² = 8.44, P < 0.005).

Discussion

In this study, we have found evidence of extravasation of In-111-IgG in early RSD. This extravasation increased with time. We and others have demonstrated previously that In-111-IgG accumulates with time in infectious and non-infectious inflammatory foci (Fischman et al. 1988; LaMuraglia et al. 1989; Rubin et al. 1989; Oyen et al. 1990, 1991, 1992a,b). This accumulation is most probably due to increased permeability for macromolecules (Morrel et al. 1989; Oyen et al. 1992c). The steadily increasing activity of In-111-IgG over 48 h in 15 of our patients therefore strongly suggests an inflammatory reaction in early RSD. Increased vascular permeability can not be fully explained by either
increased activity of the sympathetic nervous system, abnormalities in vasomotor activity or psychogenic disorders. An inflammatory process not only explains the objective clinical findings such as edema, swelling, erythema and impaired function, but may also be involved in development of pain (tissue ischemia, increased tissue pressure etc.) However, an inflammatory component does not preclude a role of the sympathetic nervous system as a factor involved in the whole array of abnormalities in RSD. The nervous system is not only involved in modulation of processing of pain stimuli in the spinal cord (Wall and Melzack 1984), but also in the spread of nociceptor excitation due to release of vasoactive substances (so-called neurogenic inflammation) (Foreman and Jordan 1984). The latter can be the cause, an aggravating factor or a factor responsible for the further spread of the inflammatory reaction in the affected extremity. This also might explain the success of sympathetic blocks in some patients by interrupting the vicious circle between periphery and central nervous system (Procacci and Maresca 1987). However, not all patients with clear clinical symptoms respond well to this type of therapy. It has been reported that aggravation of pain may occur after regional guanethidine block in acute RSD, indicating that local factors are involved (Driessen et al. 1983). Moreover, the identification of an inflammatory component in RSD may prove relevant for therapeutic interventions aiming at adequate cessation of pain and at limitation of persisting disabilities: therapy targeted at the harmful consequences of inflammation, such as free radical production, or at least limitation of its effects may prove to be advantageous (Goris 1985; Goris et al. 1987; Langendijk et al. 1993).

Since the flow phase T/B ratios - when In-111-IgG was in the intravascular space - and the T/B ratios after 24 and 48 h - when a portion of the In-111-IgG was in the extravascular space - were not correlated, it appears that 2 separate phenomena are involved in RSD: firstly, an abnormality in the blood flow to the affected hand and secondly, increased permeability for large proteins, such as In-111-IgG. The presence of 2 phenomena was further exemplified by the 2 patients with a diminished flow that clearly showed increasing activity in the affected hand on the late static images.

All patients showed abnormalities in the arterial or venous phase of the In-111-IgG scintigraphy. Increased flow has also been noted by other authors, who used the bone scanning agent technetium-99m (Tc-99m) diphosphonate (Kozin et al. 1976b; Kozin et al. 1981; Maurer et al. 1983; Greyson and Tepperman 1984; Demangeat et al. 1988). This has been explained by altered sympathetic nervous activity, resulting in abnormalities of the vasomotor tone. Blockx and Driessens (1991) imaged patients up to 20 min, using Tc-99m labeled human serum albumin (HSA). In the majority of patients with early RSD, an increased flow was found, followed by a decrease of T/B ratios. This pattern was very similar to the pattern observed for the flow phases and early images of In-111-IgG: increased flow, followed by a decrease of the T/B ratios (In-111-IgG patterns A and B). Blockx et al. hypothesized that the relative decrease in the first 20 min was caused by a fall in vascular resistance due to opening of arteriovenous shunts. They considered the images after 10 min to be a steady state. Unfortunately, they did not perform imaging beyond 20 min, so evidence of extravasation of Tc-99m-HSA beyond these relatively early images was not available.

Greyson and Tepperman (1984) found in 8 of 21 patients with early RSD after a cerebrovascular accident decreased flow with increased uptake on the late diphosphonate bone scan images. They speculated that this was due to a decreased flow to the soft tissues, while bone blood flow was relatively increased. Their data were confirmed by the results of Demangeat et al. (1988) who found decreased arterial flow in 8% of their cases. An inflammatory response could also explain the scintigraphic findings after administration of a bone scanning agent in RSD patients. On top of increased uptake in bone due to increased flow, an even larger portion of the Tc-99m-diphosphonate dose would be available for binding to bone when vascular permeability is increased.

Despite persisting abnormalities in the arterial and venous phase, 5 of 6 patients with stage II RSD had a negative In-111-IgG scintigraphy with regard to the static images. This indicates that the increased permeability for macromolecules decreases after approximately 5 months. This suggests, that the inflammatory response subsides with time, when atrophy and dystrophy become more apparent. Demangeat et al. (1988) observed normalization of the bone scan pattern in stage II in 32% of their patients.

The scarce histological findings in the literature are in agreement with our findings. Kozin et al. (1976a) noted inflammatory changes in 2 patients with early RSD. Two other patients, who showed no histologic evidence of inflammation, had RSD for as long as 1 year. Since 2 of 4 patients had late RSD, the time point for demonstrating inflammation in RSD might have been less optimal in their small group of patients. Therefore, one might question the validity of their conclusion that histologically no frank inflammation is involved in RSD. In skeletal muscle biopsies, taken from patients with RSD, evidence of pathologic muscle alterations due to oxidative stress was observed (Tilman et al. 1990). Our present data are also in agreement with previous clinical studies that suggested the tissue damage in RSD was due to an inflammatory response, caused by free oxygen radicals (Goris et al. 1987, 1990).
In conclusion, the present data support the hypothesis that a flow-independent, inflammatory component is present in RSD. It can be observed especially in early RSD and may subside in the course of the disease. Our findings do not support the current consensus that altered sympathetic activity and subsequent vasomotor tone changes are the sole somatic factors responsible for the development of RSD.

From a pathophysiologic point of view, a multi-phase In-111-IgG scintigraphy appears to be better suited for the assessment of RSD than conventional 3-phase bone scintigraphy, since both flow phenomena and late, flow-independent In-111-IgG accumulation can be evaluated. The evolution of the scintigraphic pattern after therapy and a possible correlation between scintigraphy and the outcome of therapy will be the object of further studies.

Acknowledgement

The authors express their gratitude to D.J. Immerzeel for technical assistance.

References


