Potamogeton pectinatus Is Constitutively Incapable of Synthesizing Ethylene and Lacks 1-Aminocyclopropane-1-Carboxylic Acid Oxidase

Jacky E. Summers, Laurentius A. C. J. Voesenek, Cornelius W. P. M. Blom, Mervyn J. Lewis, and Michael B. Jackson*

Institute of Arable Crops Research-Long Ashton, Department of Agricultural Sciences, University of Bristol, Long Ashton Research Station, Long Ashton, Bristol BS18 9AF, United Kingdom (J.E.S., M.J.L., M.B.J.); and Department of Ecology, University of Nijmegen, Toernooiveld 1, 6525 ED Nijmegen, The Netherlands (L.A.C.J.V., C.W.P.M.B.)

A highly sensitive laser-driven photoacoustic detector responsive to ≤2.1 nmol m⁻³ ethylene (50 parts per trillion [v/v]) was used for ethylene analysis. Dark-grown plants of Potamogeton pectinatus L. growing from small tubers made no ethylene. Exposure of shoots to white light, wounding, submergence in water followed by desubmergence, partial oxygen shortage, indole acetic acid, or carbon dioxide failed to induce ethylene production, although clear effects were observed in Pisum sativum L. Some ethylene was released after applying high concentrations of the ethylene precursor 1-aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylic acid (ACC; 10 mol m⁻³) to P. pectinatus, but the amount was trivial compared with that released by P. sativum. More endogenous ACC was found in P. pectinatus than in P. sativum. Considerable ACC oxidase activity was present in tissue extracts of P. sativum. However, no ACC oxidase activity was found in P. pectinatus, indicating that this is where ethylene production is arrested.

Ethylene is one of the major hormones regulating many aspects of plant growth and development. Although its physiological activity at small concentrations was recognized more than 90 years ago (Neljubov, 1901), rigorous identification of ethylene, as a product of metabolism, was not achieved until 1934, when Gane chemically identified the gas as a product of ripening Worcester Pearmain apples. In subsequent years, various methods, including bioassays (Denny and Miller, 1935), GC (Huelin and Kennet, 1959), MS (Turner et al., 1975), and, more recently, photoacoustic spectroscopy (Harren et al., 1990), have shown that all vegetative and reproductive plant parts appear to synthesize ethylene. As far as we can determine from the literature (Yang, 1984; Osborne, 1989; Mattow and White, 1991; Abeles et al., 1992), no species of higher plant, nor any growing organ or tissue, has been found incapable of synthesizing ethylene, unless oxygen is withdrawn. Thus, ethylene has come to be regarded as an essential component of the hormone compliment needed for normal growth and development by plants. For example, most aquatic and semiaquatic species examined (Musgrave et al., 1972; Jackson, 1985; Kende, 1987; Pearce et al., 1992; Voesenek et al., 1992) produce ethylene in amounts sufficient to accelerate elongation under water. Thus, by means of ethylene action, shoots quickly regain contact with better lit and aerated conditions if they become totally submerged by rising water levels.

In all vascular plants reported to date, a Met-based pathway predominates (Adams and Yang, 1979). Key steps in this pathway include the enzymic conversion of S-adenosyl-L-Met to ACC by ACC synthase and the oxidation of ACC to ethylene by ACC oxidase. However, in some ferns, mosses, lycopods, and microorganisms, other pathways can operate (Osborne, 1989).

Against this background, we were surprised by our preliminary experiments (Summers and Jackson, 1993), the results of which suggested that growing shoots of overwintering tubers of Potamogeton pectinatus, a common monocotyledonous aquatic weed of temperate climates (Devlin and Karczmarczyk, 1975), do not appear to synthesize ethylene. These results were obtained by conventional flame-ionization GC, a technique capable of routinely detecting above approximately 0.4 μmol m⁻³ in 10⁻⁶ m³ (0.01 parts per million, v/v). However, as is common practice with this approach, ethylene production was sought after first sealing excised pieces of tissue into small containers for at least 1 h prior to head space analysis. Unfortunately, this method can give erroneous data for a variety of reasons (Morgan et al., 1990; Brailsford et al., 1993), including wound-stimulated ethylene production (Jackson and Campbell, 1976) and separation from metabolism-sustaining plant parts, such as a starchy tuber in the case of P. pectinatus (Summers and Jackson, 1994).

In the present work, we overcame the problems of conventional head space analysis associated with GC by using a more sensitive ethylene detector. This allowed groups of two to six intact plants to be monitored on-line in a slowly flowing stream of moist air. Any ethylene released by the

---

1 This work was supported by the European Commission Science Plan RTD Programme, contract no. SCI*-CT91 0739.
* Corresponding author; e-mail mike.jackson@bbsrc.ac.uk; fax 44–1275-394–281.

Abbreviation: ppt, parts per trillion.
plants into the air stream was quantified using a laser-driven photoacoustic detector that was at least 200 times more sensitive than flame-ionization GC and had a working sensitivity of approximately 2 nmol m⁻³ ethylene (50 ppt, v/v). By this means we demonstrate, with the maximum available rigor, that rapidly growing *P. pectinatus* shoots are unable to produce ethylene in air, even when exposed to treatments that stimulate biosynthesis of the gas in other species.

**MATERIALS AND METHODS**

**Plant Material**

Tubers of *Potamogeton pectinatus* L., each bearing a prominent apical shoot (Summers and Jackson, 1994), were collected from an established perennial stand in the River Evenlode (Oxfordshire, UK) in September 1993 and stored in the dark for up to 6 months at 2°C in wet, coarse gravel. Before use, tubers were surface sterilized in 2% (v/v) commercial sodium hypochlorite solution and rinsed in distilled water, bleached (sodium hypochlorite—5% available chlorine) and rinsed in distilled water, and two to six individuals (approximately 1 g fresh weight) were placed into 30 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ glass cuvettes and held under water by glass ballottini (English Glass Company, Leicester, UK) at 20°C for approximately 24 h. By this time, shoot elongation had started. Cuvettes were then drained and connected to a flow of moist air (1 × 10⁻³ m⁻³ h⁻¹) from which ethylene and other hydrocarbons were first removed using a platinized catalyst heated to 400°C (Voesenek et al., 1992) and alkaline potassium permanganate adsorbed onto silica gel (Stayfresh, London, UK). Any chemical or gas treatments were given to the plants at least 15 h after first connecting the cuvette to a laser-driven intracavity photoacoustic detector tuned for maximum ethylene absorbance (Harren et al., 1990). *Pisum sativum* L. cv Eminent seeds were soaked in distilled water and germinated in 20°C for approximately 6 h, after which time the inflow was switched back to air.

**Chemical Treatments**

Fifteen hours after connection to the photoacoustic detector, plants within the cuvettes were completely submerged in 20 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of distilled water and 10 mol m⁻³ ACC or 0.1 mol m⁻³ IAA. The solutions were injected into the cuvettes through a needle inserted through a septum. The cuvettes remained closed and connected to the detector, and ethylene released from solution-covered plants continued to be monitored for 4 h. Treatment solutions were then withdrawn through the needle, and ethylene subsequently released from the desubmerged plants was monitored for approximately 20 h.

**Gas Treatments**

After 15 h the inflow of air through cuvettes was switched either to nitrogen containing 5 kPa oxygen or to air enriched with CO₂ to 10 kPa. These treatments lasted 6 h, after which time the inflow was switched back to air.

**Wounding**

Between 10 and 12 shoots of *P. pectinatus* or *P. sativum* were placed in the cuvettes and allowed to acclimatize for 15 h. Plants were removed from the cuvette and shoots were wounded by lightly crushing with a small roller or scoring longitudinally with a needle. Shoots were then returned to the cuvettes and reconnected to the flow-through system and flushed through with ethylene-free air for 5 min before ethylene measurements were recommenced.

**Assay for Endogenous ACC**

Concentrations of ACC in *P. pectinatus* subjected to the various submergence or chemical treatments were measured using a method modified from Lizada and Yang (1979). In brief, 0.25 g fresh weight of tissue was frozen in liquid nitrogen, ground dry with sand in a mortar and pestle on ice, reground with 4 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of 96% (v/v) ice-cold ethanol, and centrifuged at 1500g for 5 min. The pellet was extracted in 4 × 10⁻³ m⁻³ of 96% (v/v) ethanol prior to centrifugation. The supernatants were combined and evaporated to dryness. The residue was taken up in 8 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of 50% (v/v) dichloromethane and thoroughly mixed. After the sample had undergone phase separation, 0.6 × 10⁻⁹ m⁻³ aliquots of the water layer were placed in two 5 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ Erlenmeyer flasks, to which 0.1 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of 100 mol m⁻³ mercuric chloride was added with either 10 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of 78 mmol m⁻³ ACC as a conversion standard or 10 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of water. Flasks were sealed with Suba-seal rubber puncture caps (W. Freeman and Co., Bradford, UK) and 0.2 × 10⁻⁶ m⁻³ of a mixture comprising saturated sodium hydroxide, a 12.5% (v/v) solution of commercial bleach (sodium hypochlorite—5% available chlorine) and water (4:8:3, respectively) was injected. The reaction mixture was shaken and kept at room temperature for 9 to 15
min before $1 \times 10^{-6} \text{ m}^{-3}$ of head space gas was analyzed for ethylene by flame-ionization GC. The reliability of the assay for endogenous ACC was tested by establishing the conversion percentage of ACC to ethylene and demonstrating a 1:1 linearity of conversion to ethylene over a wide range of ACC concentrations added to plant extracts. Conversion percentages for *P. pectinatus* and pea were on the order of 82% and 88%, respectively. Since conversion levels were similar over a wide range of ACC concentrations, only one concentration of standard ACC (0.78 nmol ACC/vial) was routinely used to estimate the efficiency of ACC conversion in each extract.

Because the Lizada and Yang assay for ACC has been criticized for lack of specificity and accuracy under some circumstances (Hall et al., 1989; Shauvaux et al., 1994), we used two mass spectrophotometric methods to confirm the presence and amount of ACC in elongating, dark-grown shoots of *P. pectinatus*. In brief, ACC in extracts of *P. pectinatus* was derivatized to $N$-benzoyl $n$-propyl ACC and purified by HPLC (Hall et al., 1993). Purified samples were evaporated to dryness before being taken up in 100 mm$^2$ of ethyl acetate. The presence of endogenous ACC was determined by injecting $1 \times 10^{-9} \text{ m}^3$ to $2 \times 10^{-9} \text{ m}^3$ into a Mega gas chromatograph (Carlo Erba, Milan Italy) linked to an MS80RFA mass spectrometer (Kratos, Manchester, UK). The gas chromatograph was fitted with an OV1701 capillary column (31 m $\times$ 0.22 mm); the source temperature was 200°C, and the injector and interface temperatures were 250°C. Splitless injection was used with the split valve opening after 30 s. The instrument was set to scan at 1 s per decade from mass 500 down to 40 in the positive electron-ionization mode. The total analysis time was 30 min. The quantity of endogenous ACC in purified, derivatized extracts of shoots of *P. pectinatus* was determined in one set of extracts using selected ion monitoring with a Hewlett-Packard 5890AGC gas chromatograph coupled to an HP5970 mass-selective detector (Hall et al., 1989). The ions monitored were at $m/z$ 159 and 187. These are common to both $N$-benzoyl $n$-propyl ACC contained in derivatized plant extracts and to $N$-benzoyl isobutyl ACC, which was used as an internal standard that chromatographed separately from the $N$-propyl derivative.

**ACC Oxidase Activity**

ACC oxidase enzyme activity was measured in extracts from elongating shoots of *P. pectinatus* and 5-d-old pea shoots according to the method of Smith and John (1993). All extractions were performed in an anaerobic work station (Forma Scientific, Marietta, OH). Fresh tissue (2.5 g) was frozen in liquid nitrogen, ground with acid-washed sand in $4 \times 10^{-6} \text{ m}^3$ of extraction buffer (100 mol m$^{-3}$ Tricine, pH 8.0, 30% [v/v] glycerol), filtered, and centrifuged at 1500g for 20 min. The supernatant was desalted using a Sephadex (PD 10 G 25 M) column. Aliquots of the desalted supernatant were incubated in $5 \times 10^{-6} \text{ m}^{-3}$ Erlenmeyer flasks, at 30°C, with a mixture containing 100 mol m$^{-3}$ Tricine, pH 7.5, 30 mol m$^{-3}$ NaHCO$_3$, 30% [v/v] glycerin, 0.1 mol m$^{-3}$ FeSO$_4$, 30 mol m$^{-3}$ sodium ascorbate, and 1 mol m$^{-3}$ ACC. After 1 h, $1 \times 10^{-9} \text{ m}^{-3}$ head space gas was analyzed for ethylene content by flame-ionization GC. Protein was determined by the method of Bradford (1976) with thyroglobulin as the standard. Boiled extracts were used as blanks.

**RESULTS**

**Basal Ethylene Production**

For 10 h after plants were placed in the cuvettes, peas produced a large but declining amount of ethylene (Fig. 1A). This was probably wound-induced ethylene associated with initial handling and root excision. This handling effect has also been observed by laser analysis of ethylene production by roots of intact *Zea mays* seedlings (Brailsford et al., 1993). After 10 h, a steady production of approximately 0.6 fmol s$^{-1}$ per seedling was established (Fig. 1A). In contrast, *P. pectinatus* failed to evolve any detectable ethylene during the first 10 h after connection to the detector or during the following 14 h (Fig. 1B). This was also the case in 33 other similar experiments with *P. pectinatus* plants. When the sensitivity of the system was enhanced 2-fold by halving the air flow rate to $0.5 \times 10^{-3} \text{ m}^3 \text{ h}^{-1}$, ethylene production by *P. pectinatus* remained undetectable. In some instances, shoots of *P. pectinatus* were exposed to white light for 75 h within the cuvettes. During this time they became green, but the output of ethylene remained undetectable (result not shown).

**Submergence in Water, IAA, or ACC**

Four-hour-long submergence treatments in water or in solutions of ACC or IAA started approximately 15 h after plants were first placed in cuvettes, i.e. at least 5 h after steady-state basal production was achieved in pea. Figure 2, A, C, and E, shows characteristic ethylene output curves for pea before, during, and after treatment. In pea, ethylene release decreased during 4 h of submergence in water (time between the two arrows in Fig. 2A). This was a result of water entrapping ethylene within the submerged shoot and slowing its escape into the cuvette head space and

![Figure 1. Ethylene production during the initial 25 h after connection of cuvettes to the photoacoustic detector system. A, *P. sativum*; B, *P. pectinatus*. The traces connect measurements made every 20 min.](image-url)
Figure 2. Effect of 4-h submergence treatment in water (A and B), 0.1 mol m\(^{-3}\) IAA (C and D), or 10 mol m\(^{-3}\) ACC (E and F) on ethylene release from growing shoots of *P. sativum* (A, C, and E) and *P. pectinatus* (B, D, and F). The inset in F shows the response to exogenous ACC when the scale for ethylene output is expanded by a factor of 25. The period of submergence treatment is shown by the arrows. Plots are of individual cuvettes. The traces connect measurements made every 20 min.

Effect of Changes in Gas Composition on Ethylene Production

Ethylene production by peas increased by 2.5 to 3.5 times the base level as soon as the inflowing gas was switched from air to air containing 10 kPa CO\(_2\) (Fig. 3A). On return back to air containing normal levels of CO\(_2\), ethylene production quickly declined to rates similar to those established prior to the switch. In contrast, when the inflowing gas was switched from air to nitrogen containing 5 kPa oxygen, ethylene production by peas decreased rapidly to 0 (Fig. 3C). Production remained imperceptible until 21 kPa oxygen was restored, when production rapidly increased to become comparable with the original base rate. In contrast, ethylene production of *P. pectinatus* remained unaffected by the amount of CO\(_2\) (Fig. 3B) or oxygen (Fig. 3D) in the inflow gas, i.e. it was entirely absent or remained below detectable levels, i.e. 50 ppt (v/v).

Effect of Wounding on Ethylene Production

After pea shoots were wounded by lightly crushing with a small roller and returned to the flow-through system, a small peak in ethylene production was observed 1.5 h later (Fig. 4A). A much larger second peak was measured after a delay of approximately 5 h. In contrast, no wound-induced ethylene production was observed when shoots of *P. pectinatus* were wounded in a similar way (Fig. 4B). Comparable results were obtained when plants were wounded by scoring with a needle (result not shown).

Concentrations of Endogenous ACC

Chromatograms of extracts of dark-grown, elongating shoots of *P. pectinatus* were obtained using a Kratos MS80RFA GC-MS. Interpretation of the spectra was complicated by the presence of relatively large amounts of compounds other than ACC, despite the preceding clean-up steps. Thus, a definitive full-scan spectrum of
Potamogeton pectinatus—a Plant without Ethylene

4 - 3 - 2

CO

□ E O

a.■*

o

□

><

\ I LI

4 - 3 - 2

1 - 0

0 10 20 30 40

4 - 3 - 2

1 - 0

0 10 20 30 40

Figure 3. Effect of increasing the partial pressure of CO₂ from ambient (approximately 35 Pa) to 10 kPa (A and B) or decreasing the oxygen partial pressure from ambient (20.8 kPa) to 5 kPa (C and D) on ethylene production by P. sativum (A and C) and P. pectinatus (B and D). Plots are of individual cuvettes. Arrows indicate the duration of treatment. The traces connect measurements made every 20 min.

benzoyl ACC, such as the one we reported earlier for Phaseolus (Hall et al., 1989), was not obtained. Despite this, the expected m/z 159, 187 ions, and the 247 molecular ion were present and eluted from the GC column at the same time as those originating from a co-injected standard. Because of this co-chromatography, it is extremely unlikely that these ions in the extract had a source other than ACC, thus confirming the presence of ACC in extracts of P. pectinatus. Endogenous ACC in P. pectinatus was also quantified by selected ion monitoring. The quantity of endogenous ACC in elongating shoots of P. pectinatus was estimated to be 10.14 ± 1.42 nmol g⁻¹ using this method (n = 5). Results from this method were statistically comparable (P = 0.05) to those obtained by the Lizada and Yang assay, which generated values of 16.36 ± 3.30 nmol g⁻¹ (n = 6) (Table I).

Using the Lizada and Yang assay, we estimated the internal concentration of ACC in pea shoots to be 5 nmol g⁻¹ compared with approximately 16 nmol g⁻¹ found in air-grown shoots of P. pectinatus (Table I). Similar values were obtained for shoots of P. pectinatus after they were submerged in water for 4 h. However, if shoots were submerged in 10 mol m⁻³ ACC solution for 4 h, the internal concentration of ACC was increased 70-fold. Submergence in 0.1 mol m⁻³ IAA for 4 h increased the internal ACC concentrations 5.5-fold in the shoots of P. pectinatus (Table I), even though this did not result in detectable ethylene production (Fig. 2B).

ACC Oxidase Activity

The ability of filtered and desalted extracts to generate ethylene from excess exogenous ACC was used as a measure of ACC oxidase activity. Considerable activity was present in extracts of pea, and this increased in proportion to the amount of extract (1.45 ± 0.13 mg protein mL⁻¹) added to the reaction mixture (Fig. 5). In contrast, extracts of P. pectinatus (2.01 ± 0.12 mg protein mL⁻¹) produced no ethylene from ACC, regardless of the volume of extract added to the reaction mixture (Fig. 5). Thus, P. pectinatus shoots did not appear to contain ACC oxidase.

DISCUSSION

Preliminary work using conventional flame-ionization GC failed to detect basal ethylene production in dark-grown shoots of tubers of P. pectinatus (Summers and Jackson, 1993). We have now confirmed this result using highly sensitive laser photoacoustics that routinely detects 50 ppt benzene.

Table 1. Internal ACC concentrations of shoots of pea and P. pectinatus plants grown in air or submerged for 4 h in water, IAA (0.1 mol m⁻³), or ACC (10 mol m⁻³).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species and Treatment</th>
<th>Internal ACC Concentration nmol g⁻¹ fresh wt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P. pectinatus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air</td>
<td>16.36a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>22.40a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IAA</td>
<td>90.49b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACC</td>
<td>1188.93c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pea</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air</td>
<td>5.20d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACC was measured using a modification to the method of Lizada and Yang (1979). Means (n = 6) with the same letter are not significantly different (P = 0.05) based on t tests and analysis of variance.
When tissue was submerged in water for 4 h to force an accumulation of ethylene within the tissues prior to it being released within a few minutes on desubmergence, no ethylene output was detected. Based on this null response and the response was analyzed by linear regression (means of five ethylene-free shoots of *P. pectinatus*). The absence of ACC oxidase activity in tissue extracts confirmed that the absence of this enzyme explains the lack of ethylene production when ACC was applied to shoots of *P. pectinatus*, indicating a total block to ethylene production at the last oxidative step. This result explains why treatments that stimulate the preceding ACC synthase step (auxin, physical wounding; Nakagawa et al., 1991) failed to enhance ethylene production in *P. pectinatus*.

The presence of considerable amounts of endogenously synthesized ACC that exceeded at least 3-fold those in pea showed that ACC synthase and ACC accumulation were not limiting ethylene biosynthesis in *P. pectinatus*. This reinforces the view that production of the gas is arrested by the absence of ACC oxidation. In addition, IAA treatment substantially increased the internal ACC concentration of *P. pectinatus*, indicating that the enzyme ACC synthase was functional and its activity was capable of regulation, although this did not result in ethylene biosynthesis. Large amounts of exogenous ACC readily penetrated *P. pectinatus* plants given 10 mol m\(^{-3}\) ACC, although only trace amounts of ethylene were released. The absence of ACC oxidase activity in tissue extracts confirmed that the absence of this enzyme explains the lack of ethylene production capacity. The small amounts of ethylene discharged from shoot tissues supplied with ACC may therefore have been of chemical or microbiological origin rather than being generated by ACC oxidase action within the plant's cells. ACC oxidase is normally coded for by a small multigene family. In tomato, related genes are differentially expressed in ripening fruits and wounded leaves (Holdsworth et al., 1987). Whether similar genes are absent or mutated in *P. pectinatus* or whether there is a block to transcription or posttranscriptional processes remains unknown. These results help to raise the profile of ACC oxidase as a rate-limiting step to ethylene biosynthesis in certain circumstances. We have recently shown that, in tomato plants stressed by soil flooding, ethylene production by the petioles is limited by the ACC oxidase step (English et al., 1996).

**Ethylene Biosynthesis**

In higher plants, Met, the principal precursor of ethylene (Abeles et al., 1992), is converted to S-adenosyl L-Met, which in turn is converted to ACC by the pyridoxal phosphate-requiring enzyme ACC synthase. Because of the instability of ACC synthase transcripts and enzyme (Nakagawa et al., 1991), this is usually regarded as the rate-limiting step in ethylene biosynthesis. The subsequent and last step in biosynthesis is mediated by ACC oxidase (ACC N-mono-oxygenase), which first binds with oxygen and then with ACC, converting ACC to ethylene in the presence of CO\(_2\) (Yang et al., 1993). On the basis of the rapid rate at which exogenously applied ACC is normally converted to ethylene, ACC oxidase is usually considered to be in excess of that needed to oxidize the relatively small amounts of endogenous ACC. Thus, under well-aerated conditions, ACC oxidase is often considered unlikely to be a control point for ethylene production. In light of this, it was surprising to find almost no increase of ethylene production when ACC was applied to shoots of *P. pectinatus*, reinforcing the view that production of the gas is arrested by the absence of ACC oxidation. In addition, IAA treatment substantially increased the internal ACC concentration of *P. pectinatus*, indicating that the enzyme ACC synthase was functional and its activity was capable of regulation, although this did not result in ethylene biosynthesis. Large amounts of exogenous ACC readily penetrated *P. pectinatus* plants given 10 mol m\(^{-3}\) ACC, although only trace amounts of ethylene were released. The absence of ACC oxidase activity in tissue extracts confirmed that the absence of this enzyme explains the lack of ethylene production capacity. The small amounts of ethylene discharged from shoot tissues supplied with ACC may therefore have been of chemical or microbiological origin rather than being generated by ACC oxidase action within the plant’s cells. ACC oxidase is normally coded for by a small multigene family. In tomato, related genes are differentially expressed in ripening fruits and wounded leaves (Holdsworth et al., 1987). Whether similar genes are absent or mutated in *P. pectinatus* or whether there is a block to transcription or posttranscriptional processes remains unknown. These results help to raise the profile of ACC oxidase as a rate-limiting step to ethylene biosynthesis in certain circumstances. We have recently shown that, in tomato plants stressed by soil flooding, ethylene production by the petioles is limited by the ACC oxidase step (English et al., 1996).

**Underwater Shoot Elongation**

Most aquatic and semiaquatic species escape submergence in water that contains some oxygen by elongating stems or leaves more quickly in response to entrapped ethylene (Musgrave et al., 1972; Jackson, 1985; Kende, 1987; Voesenek et al., 1993). Shoot elongation in *P. pectinatus* is also promoted by submergence in aerated water (Summers and Jackson, 1994), even though no ethylene is synthesized to mediate in the response. Clearly, there must be some other stimulus to underwater extension growth in this species. We have previously eliminated buoyant tension as the causal factor (J.E. Summers and M.B. Jackson, unpublished data), but there remains the possibility that gaseous
signals other than ethylene are involved. Accumulations of respiratory CO₂ or a partial depletion of oxygen are the most likely candidates, since they are known to promote shoot or leaf extension in certain aquatic or submergence-tolerant species (Ku et al., 1970; Suge and Kusanagi, 1975; Raskin and Kende, 1984a; Pearce et al., 1992), although in some of these cases activity is dependent on ethylene. Our most recent work identifies the acidifying influence of respiratory CO₂ as a contributing factor (Summers and Jackson, 1996).

**Ethylene as an Essential Hormone**

Although *P. pectinatus* cannot produce ethylene, initial growth and development of these shoots is vigorous and visually normal. Stem growth is also unaffected by exogenously applied ethylene, although leaf extension and outgrowth of root primordia are stimulated (Summers and Jackson, 1993). Thus, endogenous ethylene appears not to be essential for normal development in this species, at least during early growth. Previous work also supports the view that ethylene operates at a more superficial level than some other hormones by regulating preprogrammed events rather than helping to establish the basic cellular and organizational framework. For example, normal vegetative growth has been observed under hypobaric pressures at which the concentration of ethylene within tissues is greatly reduced (Reid, 1987). Furthermore, Cameron and Reid (1983) found that, after application of sufficient Ag⁺ to strongly inhibit the action of ethylene, there was no perceptible effect on growth development and flowering of various taxa, although the abscission of flower petals was inhibited. The essentially normal phenotype of ethylene-insensitive mutants of *Arabidopsis thaliana* or tomato (Ecker, 1995) also strongly indicates that ethylene is less pivotal to normal growth (i.e. in the absence of marked environmental stress) than are auxins, GAs, and cytokinins. A recent description of ethylene as “... a volatile with a finger in numerous ‘developmental pies’” (Roberts and Hooley, 1988) seems appropriate. The secondary role of ethylene compared to GA is highlighted in *Callitriche platycarpa* (Musgrave et al., 1972) and deep-water rice (Raskin and Kende, 1984b), in which the promoting effect of ethylene on stem extension is totally dependent on GA biosynthesis, whereas stimulation of stem extension by GA is independent of ethylene (Bleeker et al., 1987) and our own evidence (Summers and Jackson, 1996) that GA actively promotes stem elongation in *P. pectinatus*, even though there is no endogenous ethylene production.

**SUMMARY**

Using the most sensitive techniques available, we have demonstrated that young plants of *P. pectinatus* do not produce ethylene. The plants are rich in ACC, but an inherent feature is that conversion of ACC to ethylene is blocked. Thus, *P. pectinatus* appears to be a higher plant species that is incapable of producing ethylene and one of the clearest examples of ACC oxidase limiting ethylene biosynthesis in growing vegetative organs.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We thank Frans Harren, Cor Sikkens, and Huug de Vries (Department of Molecular and Laser Physics, University of Nijmegen, The Netherlands) and Gerard Bögemann (Department of Ecology, University of Nijmegen) for help with the photoacoustic laser detection system. Francis Huitink (Department of Ecology, University of Nijmegen) for guidance with ACC assays, and Mark Else and Steve Croker (IACR-Long Ashton Research Station) for MS.

Received December 20, 1995; accepted April 19, 1996.

Copyright Clearance Center: 0032-0889/96/111/0901/08.

**LITERATURE CITED**

Denny FE, Miller LP (1935) Production of ethylene by plant tissue as indicated by the epinastic response of leaves. Contrib Boyce Thompson Inst Plant Physiol 7: 97–102
Gane R (1934) Production of ethylene by some ripening fruits. Nature 134: 1008
Kende H (1987) Studies on internodal growth using deep-water rice. In DJ Cosgrove, DP Knievel, eds, Physiology of Cell Expan-